

REPORT

IMPACT ASSESSMENT OF CAAHT PREVENTION SERVICES

May – July 2009

This assessment report is produced for the Coordinated Action Against Human Trafficking Program

The Impact Assessment of Anti-Trafficking Prevention Services is conducted by the Albanian National Training and Technical Assistance Resource Center (ANTTARC)

CONTENTS

	page
Executive Summary	1
Chapter 1: Introduction	5
1.1. Program overview	5
1.2. Assessment goal and objectives	6
1.3. Assessment methodology	6
1.4. Limitations	7
Chapter 2: Preparation for the assessment	8
2.1. Documentation review	8
2.2. Development of interview questionnaires	8
2.3. Identification of interviewees	8
Chapter 3: Assessment findings	9
3.1. Conduct of individual interviews	9
3.2. Assessment findings	11
3.2.1. Anti-trafficking prevention services provided by NPOs	11
3.2.2. Benefit from AT prevention services	13
3.2.3. Prevention services from which people have benefited most	14
3.2.4. Family support to participation in AT prevention services	15
3.2.5. How useful are prevention services for other people	17
3.2.6. Improvement of prevention services and their methods in the future	18
3.2.7. Impact of AT prevention services	20
3.2.8. Results of AT prevention services according to service providers	22
Chapter 4: Conclusions and recommendations	25
4.1. Conclusions	25
4.2. Recommendations	26
Annexes	

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The Impact Assessment of Anti-Trafficking Prevention Services was contracted and funded by the Creative Associates International that is implementing the USAID Coordination Action Against Human Trafficking (CAAHT) Program. Our thanks go to this office for initiating the assessment and providing the requisite support to undertake this work. In particular, Sarah Stephens (Chief of Party) was actively involved by providing helpful insight and assistance throughout the assessment. Also, special thanks to the CAAHT staff, especially Alketa Gaxha and Ines Xhelilaj, for their valuable assistance in realizing the assessment. We also thank all interviewees including CAAHT prevention services' beneficiaries as well as representatives of non-profit organizations that have implemented CAAHT funded prevention services. We also thank NPOs that, in the course of fieldwork, assisted ANTTARC to conduct the assessment. Finally, this assessment was made possible by the commitment of all ANTTARC consultants.

ANTTARC

July 2009

ACRONYMS

ANTTARC	Albanian National Training and Technical Assistance Resource Center
AT	Anti-Trafficking
CAAHT	Coordinated Action Against Human Trafficking
NPO	Non Profit Organization
USAID	United States Agency for International development
YWCA	Young Women Christian Association

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Creative Associates International contracted the Albanian National Training and Technical Assistance Resource Center (ANTTARC) to conduct an assessment of the anti-trafficking prevention services delivered with the funding from the Coordinated Action Against Human Trafficking (CAAHT) program. The assessment **goal** was to identify results and impact of CAAHT prevention services. The assessment **objectives** included: a) Assessment of the impact of CAAHT grantee prevention services; and b) Identification of which prevention service techniques were most effective. This report summarizes main findings and conclusions deriving from interviews with beneficiaries as well as staff of NPO service providers.

Interviews were conducted during May-July 2009. 140 beneficiaries including 112 adults (over 18 years old) and 28 adolescents (12-17 years old) as well as 12 NPO staff were interviewed. Interviewees were selected based on the following criteria: Proportional representation of different NPOs/service providers; Representation of different areas of the country; and Gender and age balance. Different questionnaires were administered with adult and adolescent beneficiaries. Another questionnaire was administered with NPO staff. Interviews focused on the effectiveness of main anti-trafficking prevention services: Vocational training; Group and individual counseling; Remedial education; Employment placement; and Small business support. The assessment methodology was based on the appreciative inquiry approach: Interviewees were encouraged to share and reflect on success stories.

Overall, findings strongly emphasize the effectiveness of anti-trafficking prevention services and methods that were used to implement these services. Also, findings strongly suggest the need for the continuation of these services in the future. Main assessment findings are presented below.

Participation in anti-trafficking prevention services

Adult interviewees have participated mainly in remedial education sessions (98% of them), group counselling (79%), vocational training courses (62%), awareness raising sessions (60%), and individual counselling sessions (46%). Adolescent interviewees have participated in remedial education (100% of them), group counselling sessions (96%), individual counselling (86%), vocational training courses (60%) and anti-trafficking awareness raising sessions (54%).

Benefit from anti-trafficking prevention services

Adult interviewees emphasize that they have benefited anti-trafficking knowledge (100% of them), vocational skills (62%), emotional support (48%), employment (19%), and small business support (2%). Adolescent interviewees mentioned knowledge on children rights and anti-trafficking.

Prevention services from which people have benefited most

Adult interviewees emphasize that they have most benefited from vocational training courses (especially tailoring and hair dressing), remedial education sessions, individual

counselling, and anti-trafficking awareness sessions. Only few respondents say they have benefited from employment placement and small business support. Interviewees rank as most important to them employment and vocational training courses. Adolescent interviewees appreciate most remedial education sessions and counselling.

Family support to participate in anti-trafficking prevention services

In general, adult interviewees emphasize that they have had their family support to participate in different anti-trafficking prevention services provided by NPOs. They have had full support of their families for their participation in vocational training courses. Since vocational training courses have been accompanied with remedial education sessions, participants have not had any objection from their families to participate. However, some interviewees mentioned that women over 35 years old were discouraged. Most of adolescent interviewees (96% of them) answered that their families have supported them to participate in prevention services. Their parents believe that by going there children get education and stay away from bad people.

How useful are the anti-trafficking prevention services for other people?

Most of adult interviewees (86% of them) think that these services are important for other people that have not yet participated. There are many people especially young girls that are not aware of the risk of trafficking. Such activities also increase community's awareness of human trafficking and potential victims of trafficking are saved. These services are important for people from rural and remote areas in a difficult economic and social situation and Roma community. Adolescent interviewees suggest for other people vocational training courses and awareness activities that should be combined with artistic and sportive activities.

Improvement of prevention services and their methods

Adult interviewees suggest that: Participation in education and awareness sessions should also extend to other people such as young boys, parents, teachers, social workers, health workers, etc.; These sessions should be continuous; Vocational training courses are useful and in need; People that have completed vocational courses should be further supported to get a job and/or start their business; Prevention activities should be based on a better assessment of the situation; Prevention activities should be practical and close to the community; Different prevention activities should combine and reinforce each-other.

Adolescent interviewees think that: There are many other people that need information about trafficking; Vocational training courses should continue because they are qualitative and create employment opportunities; Vocational training courses should be more diverse and include more practice; Prevention services should be combined with sportive and artistic activities; More awareness and entertaining activities should be organized for the Roma community; Simple methods (explanations, real life cases, role plays, games, exhibition, etc.) should be used during education and awareness sessions and counselling.

Impact of anti-trafficking prevention services

According to adult interviewees, the impact of anti-trafficking services is:

- Vocational training has increased their employment opportunities.

- Interviewees that have participated in vocational training, think that their involvement in education and counselling sessions has been useful. Combination of both services have helped them gain information and knowledge for different social issues.
- Emotional support, especially through individual and group counselling is considered very useful. Interviewees say that they feel relieved when they express themselves about problems and wishes.
- NPOs' employment placement mediation has resulted in employment.
- In different prevention services participants have also received information about anti-trafficking. This has helped increase participants' awareness of trafficking.

Adolescent interviewees also think that prevention services have been important to them.

- Interviewees that have completed vocational courses say that they feel good and optimistic about the future.
- Education sessions have helped them clarify and understand trafficking and improve their communication and attitude.
- In education sessions they have learned how to protect themselves and help others.
- Interviewees from the Roma community answered that due to the information they received they feel more secure.

Results of anti-trafficking prevention services according to service providers

According to interviewees from NPO staff:

- Prevention services have met needs of beneficiaries.
- Combination of vocational training courses with remedial education and awareness sessions, emotional support, and counselling has contributed to the effectiveness of prevention services.
- Vocational training has been followed by employment placement and small business support.
- Prevention services are monitored and evaluated continuously. Necessary corrections are made based on lessons learned.
- Prevention services are implemented in close cooperation with local actors.
- Participation in prevention activities is not limited only to girls, women, and children. Also men are involved in these activities.

Their suggestions about future improvement include:

- Better cooperation with other institutions that are active in anti-trafficking.
- Other services should be introduced such as small businesses within NPOs that would employ beneficiaries.

Conclusions

- In general, people are willing to participate in prevention services and their families support them. In the case of adult beneficiaries, combination of vocational training with other services has helped minimize the resistance of their families. In the case of adolescent beneficiaries, their families see their participation in these services as a way to get education and stay away from wrong people.
- Anti-trafficking prevention services have been diverse including remedial education and awareness sessions, emotional support and counselling, vocational training, employment, business support, etc. Combination of these services has ensured beneficiaries' participation and effectiveness of remedial education sessions.
- Methods that are used to provide anti-trafficking knowledge for adolescent beneficiaries such as open discussions, analysis of real life cases, demonstration, plays, exhibitions, cultural and sportive activities have helped participants learn.
- Vocational training courses and employment placement are the most required services.
- Combination of vocational training courses with remedial education and counselling have proved to be effective. Participants can get a profession as well as increase their knowledge of anti-trafficking and other social issues. Prevention services have had a positive impact on socialization of people, especially women and girls from remote areas.

Recommendations

- Prevention services should be combined and reinforce each other in order to be successful in preventing human trafficking.
- Vocational courses should be more diverse. NPOs should also mediate with local institutions and businesses about the employment of beneficiaries. NPOs should also find ways to fund beneficiaries of these courses to start their small business.
- Anti-trafficking prevention services should continue in the future. There are still many people, especially young girls and children that need to benefit from such services. Prevention activities should target especially rural and remote areas with difficult economic and social situation, Roma community, etc. In addition to people in risk of trafficking, AT education and awareness activities should also include young boys and man because joint efforts are needed to fight human trafficking.

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION

Creative Associates International (CAI) contracted the Albanian National Training and Technical Assistance Resource Center (ANTTARC) to conduct the impact assessment of prevention services provided by the grantees of the Coordinated Action Against Human Trafficking (CAAHT) Program. In this framework, ANTTARC interviewed 140 people representing two groups of beneficiaries: 28 adolescents of 12-17 years old and 112 adults over 18 years old. Also, ANTTARC interviewed 12 representatives of 9 non-profit organizations that have provided these prevention services with CAAHT funding including Another Vision in Elbasan, “Vatra” Psycho-Social Center in Vlora, Murialdo Social Center in Fier, In Help of Northern Woman of Puka, Dorcas Aid International - Albania in Korçe, Women in Development in Shkodra, In Protection of Urban and Rural Women’s Rights in Berat, Intellectual Women of Pogradec, and YWCA – Albania in Tirana.

1.1. PROGRAM OVERVIEW

USAID’s *The Albanian Initiative: Coordinated Action Against Human Trafficking* (CAAHT), implemented by Creative Associates International, Inc., is a six-year effort to strengthen the capacity of Albanian NGOs to prevent trafficking in humans and to improve services that assist the victims of trafficking and help them reintegrate into their communities. The program will conclude by 30 September 2009. CAAHT has three main components:

- (1) *Coordination*. The project enables civil society and government representatives to work together to identify specific program and service needs, and to develop practical and achievable activities that effectively combat human trafficking. CAAHT works through existing governmental and nongovernmental networks at the national, district, and local levels in Albania, developing collaboration that yield demonstrable results and supports the Albanian government’s National Anti-trafficking Strategy.
- (2) *Grants*. CAAHT provides grants to local NGOs working in Albania to bolster their work in trafficking prevention and victim assistance, including reintegration. CAAHT grants fund projects beyond the traditional urban centers to ensure that better services span the entire country.
- (3) *Information*. CAAHT is developing a set of databases to facilitate and support the coordination and consolidation of data collection and analysis. The aim is that access to this information, such as reports from CAAHT and its partners, will help project grantees make their anti-trafficking programs more efficiently run and more responsive to victims’ needs.

Since 2005, the CAAHT program has provided grant support to 11 NPOs working in ten municipalities and their nearby communes to conduct a variety of prevention services in

their communities. These services may include vocational training, anti-trafficking awareness raising, group and individual counseling, remedial education, employment placement and/or small business support. Grantee organizations have been encouraged to coordinate with relevant governmental structures to maximize efficiency of use of resources and to compliment the programs and services government entities provide for vulnerable women and children. Local government partners include vocational training centers, labor offices, health services and the police as well as some *Regional Committees in the Fight Against Trafficking*.

Approximately 2,500 women and adolescents have participated in prevention services funded by the CAAHT program.

1.2. ASSESSMENT GOAL AND OBJECTIVES

The assessment **goal** was to identify results and impact of CAAHT prevention services. The assessment **objectives** include:

1. To assess the impact of CAAHT grantee prevention services; and
2. To identify which prevention service techniques are most effective.

1.3. ASSESSMENT METHODOLOGY

ANTTARC's assessment methodology included documentation review and individual interviews. It allowed ANTTARC consultants to collect the necessary data as well as verify and consolidate data that came from different sources.

The assessment methodology was based on the appreciative inquiry approach. Based on this approach, ANTTARC team selected the inquiry topics, crafted questions, and developed the interview guide. Interviewees were encouraged to share and reflect on success stories.

Three different questionnaires were developed to be administered with different actors. One questionnaire was developed to be administered with adolescents of 12-17 years old. Another questionnaire was developed to be administered with adult beneficiaries (over 18 years old). Finally, a separate questionnaire was developed to be administered with the staff of NPOs that have provided prevention services with CAAHT funding.

Interviews were conducted by ANTTARC full-time consultants. Team work reinforced by the history of working together ensured the consistency in the administration of assessment questionnaires. Interviews were scheduled in a way that ensured both effectiveness and efficiency. ANTTARC realized the highest number of interviews possible within the shortest period of time.

ANTTARC selected the interviewees randomly based on the criteria specified in the project proposal submitted to the CAAHT program. The selection criteria included: proportional representation of different NPOs that have provided prevention services; representation of different areas of the country; and gender and age balance. The assessment team took into consideration expected difficulties to find prevention services beneficiaries because of two main reasons: Most of beneficiaries had participated in prevention services more than one year ago; In general, during summer time it is difficult to find people in general. Therefore, a larger number of beneficiaries were initially selected for interviews in order to be able to interview the targeted sample number.

Two ANTTARC consultants led the effort for developing the questionnaires combining experience and expertise in both anti-trafficking and assessment. Other ANTTARC consultants assisted not only in the process of questionnaires development but also in the preparation for the interviews. The Interview Questionnaires were consulted with the CAAHT staff and their feedback was incorporated in the final format of the questionnaires (for more information about questionnaires, see Annex 1).

Information was collected through semi-structured interviews with the randomly selected beneficiaries. Consultants conducted the interviews mainly at the interviewees' place of work or at their homes in order to ensure an effective and efficient interview process. Proper locations, i.e. without noise and interruptions and conducive to openness were selected for the interviews. Interviews were verbal and face-to-face. Consultants were very careful to create a friendly and open atmosphere that would enable them to collect the necessary information.

1.4. LIMITATIONS

- Interviewees had difficulties to recall anti-trafficking prevention activities, especially details about their participation in these activities because they have taken place time ago (more than two years ago).
- It was difficult to locate interviewees because either there was not contact information or the contact information was outdated.
- Potential interviewees were dispersed in numerous locations/villages in each region. The assessment teams had to visit several times the same district. Therefore, the assessment visits took more time and energy than expected.
- Also, the assessment coincided with the national elections campaign that added to difficulties to arrange and conduct interviews.

CHAPTER 2: PREPARATION FOR THE ASSESSMENT

2.1. DOCUMENTATION REVIEW

The review of documentation relating to anti-trafficking prevention services is done prior to the interviewing process. It has resulted to be very important to understand the history and status of affairs. Significant reports produced by CAAHT as well as other stakeholders including Baseline Survey Report (2004), Annual Conferences Reports (2004, 2005, 2006, and 2008), Mid-Term Assessment of Coordination Activities (2007), The State of Efforts in Albania to Combat Trafficking in Persons (2004, 2005, 2006, and 2008), Impact Assessment of Activities to Prevent Trafficking in Persons in Albania 2005-2006 were consulted.

2.2. DEVELOPMENT OF INTERVIEW QUESTIONNAIRES

Three questionnaires were developed including: Questionnaire for interviews with adults (over 18 years old); Questionnaire for interviews with adolescents (12-17 years old); and Questionnaire for interviews with staff of service providers.

Interview questionnaires were developed by the team of consultants in close cooperation with CAAHT staff. The questionnaires were developed based on the appreciative inquiry approach. The questionnaires aimed at collecting information on results and impact of prevention services including:

- Vocational training
- Group and individual counseling;
- Remedial education;
- Employment placement;
- Small business support;
- Any other services.

2.3. IDENTIFICATION OF INTERVIEWEES

Interviewees included beneficiaries including adolescents and adults that have participated in prevention services funded by CAAHT. List of interviewees was selected through random sampling from the data base provided by CAAHT and organizations that have provided these services. Taking into consideration the expected difficulties in contacting beneficiaries, a larger sample of 300 people was selected including 200 adults and 100 adolescents. Potential interviewees were identified based on a set of criteria including age, gender, geographical coverage, number of beneficiaries from services provided by specific organizations, and type of services they had benefited.

CHAPTER 3: ASSESSMENT FINDINGS

3.1. CONDUCT OF INDIVIDUAL INTERVIEWS

Interviews were conducted by ANTTARC full-time consultants. Interviews were scheduled in a way that ensured both effectiveness and efficiency. ANTTARC realized the highest number of interviews possible within the shortest period of time. Observation during individual interviews was also used to collect additional information on perception of interviewees about anti-trafficking prevention services provided by the respective institutions.

During the conduct of interviews, the assessment team had difficulties to locate people that were identified as potential interviewees during the identification phase. These difficulties related to lack of contact information—the contact information was either missing or outdated—as well as demographic changes—migration, marriages, etc. Therefore, the assessment teams cooperated with the service providers to further identify potential interviewees and conduct the interviews.

ANTTARC interviewed 140 people, beneficiaries of the prevention services provided by 10 NPOs with CAAHT funding. Interviewees included:

- 140 people from 10 districts including 117 women and girls and 24 men and boys.
- 112 adults over 18 years old including 98 women and 14 men.
- 28 adolescents of 12-17 years old including 18 girls and 10 boys.
- 12 people representing staff of 9 NPOs that have provided these services including Another Vision in Elbasan, “Vatra” Psycho-Social Center in Vlora, Murialdo Social Center in Fier, In Help of Northern Woman of Puka, Dorcas Aid International - Albania in Korce, Women in Development in Shkodra, In Protection of Urban and Rural Women’s Rights in Berat, Intellectual Women of Pogradec, Women with a Development Focus in Kucova, and YWCA – Albania in Tirana.

Table 1 presents information on interviewees according to gender and location/NPOs that have offered prevention services.

Consultants entered the data by the end of the interview day. This was considered important for the purposes of accuracy. At the same time, consultants prepared a summary of findings, their conclusions, and recommendations that might derive from specific interviews. They forwarded their notes to the project coordinator who integrated data from different interviewers.

Table 1: Interviewees--Prevention Services

I. Adult interviewees (over 18 years old)				
Nr	NPO	Nr of interv	Male	Female
1	In Protection of Urban and Rural Women's Rights, Berat	40	0	40
2	Another Vision, Elbasan	4	0	4
3	Murialdo, Fier	15	8	7
4	Dorcas, Korce	8	2	6
5	Women with a Development Focus,	10	0	10
6	Gruaja Intelektuale, Pogradec	0	0	0
7	In Help of Northern Woman, Puka	8	0	8
8	Women in Development, Shkodra	8	0	8
9	YWCA, Tirana	7	2	5
10	Vatra, Vlore	12	2	10
TOTAL		112	14	98
II. Adolescent interviewees (12-17 years old)				
Nr	NPO	Nr of interv	Male	Female
1	In Protection of Urban and Rural Women's Rights, Berat	5	0	5
2	Another Vision, Elbasan	0	0	0
3	Murialdo, Fier	3	2	1
4	Dorcas, Korce	6	3	3
5	Women with a Development Focus,	1	0	1
6	Gruaja Intelektuale, Pogradec	5	3	2
7	In Help of Northern Woman, Puka	0	0	0
8	Women in Development, Shkodra	1	0	1
9	YWCA, Tirana	6	2	4
10	Vatra, Vlore	1	0	1
TOTAL		28	10	18
III. Interviewees including both adolescents (12-17years) and adults (over 18 years)				
Nr	NPO	Nr of interv	Male	Female
1	In Protection of Urban and Rural Women's Rights, Berat	45	0	45
2	Another Vision, Elbasan	4	0	4
3	Murialdo, Fier	18	10	8
4	Dorcas, Korce	14	5	9
5	Women with a Development Focus,	11	0	11
6	Gruaja Intelektuale, Pogradec	5	3	2
7	In Help of Northern Woman, Puka	8	0	8
8	Women in Development, Shkodra	9	0	9
9	YWCA, Tirana	13	4	9
10	Vatra, Vlore	13	2	11
TOTAL		140	24	116

3.2. ASSESSMENT FINDINGS

This chapter presents findings of the impact assessment of CAAHT prevention services.

3.2.1. Anti-trafficking prevention services provided by NPOs

Interviewees were asked about the prevention services where they have participated. Interviewees over 18 years old responded:

- 110 out of 112 interviewees (or 98% of them) have participated in remedial education sessions.
- 89 out of 112 interviewees (or 80 %) have participated in have participated in group counselling activities.
- 70 out of 112 interviewees (or 62%) have participated in in vocational training courses.
- 68 out of 112 interviewees (or 60%) have participated in have participated in awareness raising sessions.
- 51 out of 112 interviewees (or 46%) have participated in have participated in individual counselling sessions.
- 21 out of 112 interviewees (or 19 %) have been supported for employment
- 4 out of 112 (or 4%) interviewees have participated in have had business support.

Interviewees of 12-17 years old answer that they have participated in the following prevention services:

- All participants (28 out of 28 interviewees) have participated in remedial education sessions
- 27 out of 28 interviewees (or 96%) have participated in group counselling activities.
- 24 out of 28 interviewees (or 86%) have participated in have participated in individual counselling sessions.
- 15 out of 28 interviewees (or 54%) have participated in anti-trafficking awareness raising sessions.
- 9 out of 28 interviewees (or 32%) have participated in vocational training courses.

- Regarding employment and bussiness support, participation has been limited (one for each service).

Table 2 present participation of interviewees in prevention services according to prevention services as well as organizations that have provided these services.

Table 2: Participation in anti-trafficking prevention services by interviewees

Interviewees over 18 years	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	Total	
Nr of interviewees (total)	40	4	15	8	10	0	8	8	7	12	112	
Individual counselling	16	0	8	7	8	0	1	0	6	5	51	46%
Group counselling	32	2	15	8	9	0	5	2	6	10	89	80%
Remedial education	40	4	15	7	10	0	8	7	7	12	110	98%
Awareness sessions	40	3	3	7	10	0	0	0	5	0	68	60%
Vocational training courses	18	4	12	6	8	0	5	7	5	5	70	62%
Small business support	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	4	4	4%
Employment placement	2	1	2	4	2	0	4	2	0	4	21	19%
Other	0	0	0	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	2	2%
Interviewees 12-17 years	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	Total	
Nr of interviewees (total)	5	0	3	6	1	5	0	1	6	1	28	
Individual counselling	5	0	1	6	0	5	0	0	6	1	24	86%
Group counselling	5	0	3	6	1	5	0	0	6	1	27	96%
Remedial education	5	0	3	6	1	5	0	1	6	1	28	100%
Awareness sessions	0	0	3	6	1	5	0	0	0	0	15	54%
Vocational training courses	3	0	3	0	1	0	0	1	0	1	9	32%
Small business support	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	4%
Employment placement	0	0	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	3	11%
Other	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0%
Organizations that have provided anti-trafficking prevention services												
1. In Protection of Urban and Rural Women's Rights, Berat												
2. Another Vision, Elbasan												
3. Murialdo, Fier												
4. Dorcas, Korce												
5. Women with a Development Focus, Kucova												
6. Intellectual Women Pogradec												
7. In Help of Northern Woman, Puka												
8. Women in Development, Shkodra												
9. YWCA, Tirane												
10. Vatra, Vlore												

3.2.2. Benefit from anti-trafficking prevention services

Interviewees over 18 years old answered that from their participation in prevention services, they have benefited:

- Anti-trafficking knowledge (112 out of 112 interviewees).
- Vocational skills as a result of their participation in vocational training courses (69 out of 112 interviewees or 62% of them).
- Emotional support (54 out of 112 interviewees or 48% of them).
- Employment (21 out of 112 interviewees or 19%).
- Support for their small business initiative (4 out of 112 interviewees or 4%).
- Economic assistance (2 out of 112 interviewees or 2%).

Table 3 presents information regarding answers of adult interviewees relating to what they have benefited from anti-trafficking prevention services according to organizations that have provided these services.

Table 3: Benefit from AT prevention services by adult interviewees

Interviewees over 18 years	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	Total	%
Number of interviewees	40	4	15	8	10	0	8	8	7	12	112	
AT knowledge	40	4	15	8	10	0	8	8	7	12	112	100%
Emotional support	11	3	3	2	9	0	8	3	6	9	54	48%
Vocational training	18	4	12	5	8	0	5	7	5	5	69	62%
Business support	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	4	4	4%
Employment	2	1	2	4	2	0	4	2	0	4	21	19%
Other	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	1	2	2%
List of organizations that have provided prevention services												
1. In Protection of Urban and Rural Women's Rights, Berat												
2. Another Vision, Elbasan												
3. Murialdo, Fier												
4. Dorcas, Korce												
5. Women with a Development Focus, Kucova												
6. Intellectual Women Pogradec												
7. In Help of Northern Woman, Puka												
8. Women in Development, Shkodra												
9. YWCA, Tirane												
10. Vatra, Vlore												

Regarding the adolescent interviewees, taking into consideration their age, they were asked differently. They were asked about what they remember from their participation in anti-trafficking services provided by the NPOs. Their answers are summarized below:

- Knowledge on children rights. Regarding children rights, they mentions that children should not be violated, they should go to school and not work or beg on the street, parents should know children's rights, etc.
- Anti-trafficking knowledge. Regarding AT knowledge, interviewees mentioned that they know about human trafficking and its consequences, the profile of traffickant and victim of trafficking, how to act when they are in a trafficking situation, etc. Interviewees remember about:
 - Profile of the victim: Scared, do not trust anyone, not socializing, feels traited by the family, etc.
 - Profile of traffickant: Traffickants are difficult to distinguish; How to know a traffickant? How to protect from traffickants? Traffickants use different ways to seduce offering engagement, marriage, employment, etc. They are gentle and have money to spend.
 - Consequences of trafficking and how to protect from it. They mentioned advice they have had not to approach strangers, not to run away from home without letting parents know, etc.

3.2.3. Prevention services from which people have benefited most

Adult interviewees emphasize that anti-trafficking prevention services from which they have benefited most include:

- Vocational courses (especially tailoring and hair dressing). The reason is that these courses are complete, they are acknowledged, and create employment opportunities in local businesses.
- Remedial education sessions. Through enrollment in vocational training courses, participants could also benefit from remedial education sessions and counselling. Remedial education sessions were developed in an interactive way.
- Individual counselling. Participants could open up and share their opinions and concerns.
- Anti-trafficking awareness sessions. Several interviewees emphasized the knowledge about anti-trafficking and domestic violence legislation. Interviewees also emphasized the need for such activities in regions with high risk of trafficking.
- Employment.
- Small business support (especially relating to tailor and hairdresser shops).

Regarding their importance, adult interviewees rank them as follows:

- Employment. More than half of interviewees think that employment placement support is the most important service.
- Vocational courses. The majority of interviewees think that vocational courses are among the most important prevention services.
- Remedial education sessions.
- Counseling. Several interviewees prefer individual counseling to group counseling.
- AT awareness sessions.

Adolescent interviewees especially appreciate:

- Remedial education sessions and
- Counselling, including both individual and group counselling.

They mentioned that from their participation in these activities, they have benefited very much in different aspects:

- They have gained knowledge on anti-trafficking and human rights. They have shared these knowledge with their friends.
- They have improved their attitude and have been more careful in relationships with strangers thus preventing any trafficking risk.
- They have been entertained from the participation in other artistic and sportive activities that have been organized.

3.2.4. Family support to participate in anti-trafficking prevention services

In general, adult interviewees emphasize that they have had their family support to participate in different anti-trafficking prevention services provided by NPOs. A summary of their answers follows.

- They have had full support of their families for their participation in vocational training courses. Their families have seen vocational courses as an opportunity to learn a profession.

- Since vocational training courses have been accompanied with remedial education sessions, participants have not had any objection from their families to participate. *“My husband was convinced to let me participate in the tailoring course...But I also learned so many other things that are useful to me. Interviewee from Berati ”*
- Several interviewees answered that not only they have had their families’ support, but their family members have joined them in these activities.
- However, some interviewees mentioned that there was no problem for young girls to participate in the prevention services. But women over 35 years old were discouraged.

Adolescent interviewees were also asked about the support of their families to participate in anti-trafficking services. Most of interviewees (27 out of 28) answered that their families have supported them to participate in these services. Some of their comments are:

- They have had the support of their parents and family. Many of them have been accompanied by their parents. *“My mother even accompanied me to these services. Interviewee from Berati”*
- Parents did not become an obstacle. Moreover, they were interested that children are informed better.
- Reasons are that parents understand that in these activities children are educated and stay away of bad people.
- Some interviewees mentioned that through their participation in these activities they can also get economic assistance for their family.

Table 4 presents support that adolescent interviewees have had from their families.

Table 4: Family support for participation in prevention services

Interviewees 12-17 years	Nr.Total	Supported	%
1. In Protection of Urban and Rural Women’s Rights, Berat	5	5	100%
2. Murialdo Fier	3	3	100%
3. Dorcas Korce	6	6	100%
4. Women with a Development Focus, Kucova	1	1	100%
5. Intellectual Women Pogradec	5	5	100%
6. Women in Development, Shkodra	1	1	100%
7. YWCA Tirane	6	5	83%
8. Vatra, Vlore	1	1	100%

Adolescent interviewees were also asked whether they have shared the knowledge they have gained in different activities with their family, friends, and relatives. Most of them

(24 out of 28) mentioned that they have shared their knowledge with others, especially with their friends and families. Table 5 presents interviewees' answers regarding this issue.

Table 5: How much are knowledge shared with other

Interviewees 12-17 years	Nr.Total	Sharing knowledge	%
1. In Protection of Urban and Rural Women's Rights, Berat	5	3	60%
3. Murialdo, Fier	3	2	67%
4. Dorcas, Korce	6	6	100%
5. Women with a Development Focus, Kucova	1	1	100%
6. Intellectual Women Pogradec	5	5	100%
8. Women in Development, Shkodra	1	1	100%
9. YWCA, Tirane	6	5	83%
10. Vatra, Vlore	1	1	100%

3.2.5. How useful are the anti-trafficking services for other people?

Adult interviewees were asked about the usefulness of anti-trafficking prevention services for other people they know. Most of them (98 out of 112 or 86%) think that these services are important for other people that have not yet participated. 12 people (or 11 %) did not answer this question. Only two interviewees would not recommend these services to others. Table 6 presents interviewees' answers regarding this question.

Table 6: How useful would be prevention services to other people

Interviewees over 18	Nr.Total	Yes	No	No answer
1. In Protection of Urban and Rural Women's Rights, Berat	40	40	0	
2. Another Vision, Elbasan	4	4	0	
3. Murialdo, Fier	15	15	0	
4. Dorcas, Korce	8	8	0	
5. Women with a Development Focus, Kucova	10	10	0	
6. Intellectual Women Pogradec	8	6	0	2
7. In Help of Northern Woman, Puka	8	4	0	4
8. Women in Development, Shkodra	7	5	2	
9. YWCA, Tirane	12	6	0	6
10. Vatra, Vlore	112	98	2	12
	100%	86%	2%	11%

Reasons why they think that the prevention services are important for other people include:

- There are many people, especially young girls, that are not aware of the risk of trafficking and do not know anything about this phenomenon. Participation in these activities would help them not to make any mistakes. Especially girls that have not been very outgoing can be potential victims of trafficking. *“Such activities are useful. They keep you away from negative things. They educate.*

*Since there is still a danger, it is necessary that all know how to protect from it.
Interviewee from Korca »*

- Such activities make possible that the all community has become aware and potential victims of trafficking are saved.
- These services are important for people from rural and remote areas with a difficult economic and social situation. Increasing their awareness of human trafficking in order to prevent trafficking of girls and women from these areas is necessary.
- Roma community need such activities and more support.
- It is important that other people including more young boys and man participate in these activities because this phenomenon can be fought together.

Adolescent interviewees were asked about other services that can be provided. In their answers they mentioned:

- Vocational courses that increase employment opportunities, also including computer, foreign language, and arts courses. More practice should be included in these courses.
- More awareness activities especially during the summer vacations. They should be combined with artistic and sportive activities.

3.2.6. Improvement of prevention services and their methods in the future

Regarding improvement of prevention services and their methods, adult interviewees suggest:

- More education and awareness sessions are needed. In these activities should participate not only more persons in risk of trafficking but also young boys, parents, teachers, social workers, health workers, etc. There are many parents that abandon their children when they do wrong though they might have been the cause for their wrongdoing. More activities should be organized for remote communities. These sessions should be continuous.
- More activities for youth are necessary so they interact with each-other, entertain, and stay away from trouble.
- Vocational courses are useful and in need. Practice in the framework of these courses should be longer in order to better learn a profession.

- People that have completed vocational courses should be further supported with employment and business support.
- NPOs' staff should increase in order to increase the number of beneficiaries from prevention services.

Interviewees think that methods used by NPOs to provide their prevention services have been effective. *“Methods made me think. They seemed simple, but we learned a lot from them especially from real cases. Interviewee from Fier”* Their suggestions include:

- Activities should be based on a better assessment of the situation. *“To make family visits to better know their reality, conditions, mentality. Interviewee from Tirana.”*
- Activities should be practical (including real life examples, movies, etc.) and close to the community.
- Work with individuals should be combined with groups and families.
- Activities should be coordinated and support each other. For example, vocational courses should be followed by employment placement and/or support for small business. *“Trafficking is fought when women are secure from the economic point of view and aware for their role in society. Interviewee from Puka.”* Some interviewees suggest NPOs establish small businesses that would employ beneficiaries.
- In the case of women and girls, especially those in risk of trafficking, individual counseling combined with family visits are effective.
- Prevention activities can be conducted by people that have experienced trafficking problems. One interviewee suggests *“having the opportunity to work with persons in risk of trafficking. Interviewee from Fier”*

Adolescent interviewees answered:

- Such activities should continue because there are many other people that need information about trafficking, children's rights, etc. They should be encouraged to participate because *“There are people like me that were ashamed to participate in these meetings. Interviewee from Berati.”*
- Vocational courses should continue because they are qualitative and create employment opportunities. These courses should be more diverse and include more practice.
- To include sportive and artistic activities, especially during summer vacations. More young people and children should participate in these activities.

- More awareness and entertaining activities should be organized for the Roma community.

Regarding the methods, they suggest:

- Use of explanations, real life cases, role plays, and discussions on anti-trafficking during education and awareness sessions and counselling. Preparation of plays from participants has proved useful.
- Simple methods to explain concepts (games, drawings, exhibitions, message writing, etc.) so people are not frustrated.
- Group discussions.
- Individual counselling.
- Use of information materials.
- Practice in the case of vocational training courses.

3.2.7. Impact of anti-trafficking prevention services

Adult interviewees have answered that anti-trafficking prevention services provided by NPOs have brought a significant change in their lives.

- Prevention services have helped increase participants' awareness of trafficking. In remedial education sessions, they have gained knowledge on anti-trafficking. These sessions have helped them develop their personality and feel more secure against trafficking. Also, they have learned how to help other in risk of trafficking. *“Many things have changed in my life: my attitude, my communication. I know how to stay away of trouble and protect myself. Interviewee from Fier.”* *“Before I was indeferent. Now, I see things differently. I am more attentive toward girls and little boys around me. Interviewee from Fier.”* Many interviewees emphasize that they have also transmitted the information and knowledge to their friends, family, and relatives.
- Methods that are used during the anti-trafficking prevention activities have been effective. *“A participant in remedial education sessions could not accept that a trafficked girl can be accepted at home. To convince her, participants prepared a play where the mother is convinced that her girl should be supported by the family. The girl should have family's support first, then community's. Interviewee from Berati”.*

- Vocational training has been very useful because it helps them get a job. These courses have helped them have a profession. Moreover, they have helped them socialize. *“Thanks to Another Vision I am a tailor and know the computer. Also, I have had counseling and have participated in education sessions on anti-trafficking. I can meet my personal needs. I can use the computer for my school homework. I feel better prepared for the real life. Interviewee from Elbasan.”*
“With my participation in the vocational training course I have opened a new window, the right to get a job. Interviewee from Korca.”
- Interviewees that have participated in vocational training, think that their involvement in education and counselling sessions has been useful. Combination of both services have helped them gain information and knowledge for different social issues.
- Emotional support, especially through individual and group counselling is considered very useful. Interviewees say that they feel relieved when they express themselves about problems and wishes. Some interviewees prefer individual counselling to group counselling.
- NPOs’ employment placement mediation is highly evaluated by interviewees. Employment would increase their independence and economic income for their family. Also the support for small business initiatives is very important. *“I have finished the tailoring course and worked in a tailor shop. I also enrolled in the part-time high school. I also worked as social operator at Vatra. I started my small business. I can, with my business, support myself and my family. All these are made possible because of Vatra. Interviewee from Vlora”*

Adolescent interviewees also think that anti-trafficking prevention services have been very important to them.

- Interviewees that have completed vocational courses say that they feel good and optimistic that they have got a profession.
- Interviewees think that education sessions are important to clarify and understand trafficking. *“...I had heard about trafficking in different ways, but not explained like in the activities organized by the association. Interviewee from Kucova.”* Interviewees say that education sessions have helped them learn about their rights, trafficking, and domestic violence. Due to this knowledge, they have improved their communication at home. They say that they are satisfied that could talk about their problems.
- Interviewees say that in education sessions they have learned how to protect themselves and how to help others in need. One interviewee who lived with her aunt because her parents were divorced, said: *“My father’s people could send me to Greece. From the sessions I learned many things: how to behave with strangers and how to protect myself from traffickers. Interviewee from Berati.”*

- Interviewees from the Roma community answered that due to the information they received they feel more secure. They have transmitted this information to other people.

3.2.8. Results of anti-trafficking prevention services according to service providers

12 staff representing 9 NPOs that have provided anti-trafficking prevention services with CAAHT funding were also interviewed. NPOs that were interviewed included Another Vision in Elbasan, “Vatra” Psycho-Social Center in Vlora, Murialdo Social Center in Fier, In Help of Northern Woman of Puka, Dorcas Aid International - Albania in Korce, Women in Development in Shkodra, In Protection of Urban and Rural Women’s Rights in Berat, Intellectual Women of Pogradec, and YWCA – Albania in Tirana.

Anti-trafficking prevention services they have provided include vocational training courses, remedial education, awareness sessions, employment and small business support.

Identification of beneficiaries

Regarding identification of their beneficiaries, interviewees from service providers emphasized:

- Beneficiaries are identified in close collaboration with key local actors including municipalities and communes, police, educational institutions, other NPOs, etc. Also, information from the Technical AT Tables has been useful to identify future beneficiaries.
- Identification of beneficiaries is conducted through field visits.
- Due to NPOs’ visibility regarding their anti-trafficking prevention services, some beneficiaries come to NPOs and ask for their services.
- Beneficiaries of anti-trafficking prevention services are identified on continuous basis.

According to interviewees from service providers, results of in anti-trafficking prevention services include:

- Prevention services have included activities (group discussions, group counselling, family visits, vocational courses, employment, business support, etc.) that meet needs of beneficiaries. *“One girl from rural areas was referred by the commune and her family to our shelter. Our multi-disciplinary team (including the social worker, psychologist, medical doctor, and lawyer) assessed her needs and provided respective services. The girl was enrolled in the tailoring course and part-time high school. Upon completion of the tailoring course, she was employed in a private enterprise. Because of lay-offs in that enterprise, she came*

back to the shelter but this time as social operator in the prevention project funded by CAAHT. One year later she left the shelter and was accommodated for about four months in an apartment together with some other beneficiaries. With our support, in 2009 she could set up her own small business—tailoring shop. At present, the girl lives with her family and runs her business in her village.” (Representative of Vatra)

- Combination of vocational training courses with remedial education and awareness sessions, emotional support, and counselling has contributed to the effectiveness of prevention services. *“In 2006, a woman and her two children were living in a village. Her husband had emigrated. People were rumoring about her. We identified the case and offered her to participate in the vocational course for tailoring and embroidery. She was committed. In addition to the vocational course, she also participated in the education and counseling sessions. At present she works at an embroidery enterprise and lives with her husband who came back from emigration and her children. We talk often on the phone and she is grateful for our support. She said that you changed my life.” (Representative of For Protection of Urban and Rural Women’s Rights)*
- Vocational training has been followed by employment placement and small business support. NPOs have mediated with employment offices and private enterprises to employ their beneficiaries. *“I remember the case of an eight year boy that was kidnapped, trafficked to Greece, and forced to beg on the street. He was returned by the Greek police in cooperation with the Albanian one. We treated him from the psychological and health point of view. We enrolled him at school. Later he was trained as a carpenter and with our mediation was employed. He still keeps contacts with us.” (Representative of Murialdo)*
- Staff of NPOs have maintained contacts with families, have cultivated social relationships, have provided emotional support in order to overcome difficult situations. *“She was the oldest girl of a family in difficult economic and social conditions. Parents were not able to work. The girl was at high school. She was in risk of trafficking concealed as engagement. We had group and individual counseling with her. She could finish high school and find a job.” (Representative of Women in Development Shkoder)*
- Prevention services have been qualitative. For example, regarding vocational courses instructors are selected carefully and the curricula has been developed carefully.
- Cooperation of the staff with other local actors has helped success of anti-trafficking prevention services.
- Participation in prevention activities is not limited only to girls and women and children. Also men are involved in these activities.

According to interviewees, services where NPOs can contribute most in the future include:

- Remedial education
- Counselling (emotional support)
- Awareness raising
- Vocational courses combined with remedial education
- Employment
- Small business support

Actors with whom they will cooperate in the future include:

- Local and central government institutions (especially municipalities and communes, educational institutions, public health institutions, etc.)
- Vocational schools
- Police
- Different potential donors.

What can be improved in anti-trafficking prevention services according to interviewees from prevention services?

- Cooperation with other institutions that are active in anti-trafficking.
- Other services should be introduced. For example, a suggestion was to establish a small business that would employ beneficiaries and also generate funds for the NPO.
- Methods of identification of beneficiaries.
- Public awareness activities, especially its methods.
- Fundraising should improve.
- Quality and effectiveness of the staff should increase.

CHAPTER 4: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

4.1. CONCLUSIONS

- NPOs have identified the beneficiaries of anti-trafficking prevention services in close collaboration with key local actors. Identification process has targeted all areas, especially those in risk of trafficking, and has been continuous.
- In general, people have been willing to participate in NPOs anti-trafficking prevention services. In general, beneficiaries's families have supported them to participate in anti-trafficking prevention services. In the case of adult beneficiaries, their participation in vocational training courses have minimized their families' resistance toward prevention services in general. In the case of adolescent beneficiaries, their families have supported their participation in these services as a way to receive education and stay away from wrongdoing. Also, participants in all anti-trafficking prevention services activities that are organized by different NPOs have been willing to contribute in the effective implementation of planned activities.
- Anti-trafficking prevention services have covered communities in risk in both urban and rural areas. Beneficiaries include people from different gender, age groups, and ethnicities.
- Initially, beneficiaries especially from the remote rural areas in difficult economic and social conditions have had limited knowledge about anti-trafficking.
- Anti-trafficking prevention services that have been provided have been diverse. NPOs have provided different services including remedial education and awareness sessions, emotional support and counselling, vocational training, employment, business support, etc. Combination of this services has ensured participation and effectiveness. Resistance to participation in these services has been minimized. Participants could learn a profession that is useful in life, learn about trafficking and other social issues, socialize with other people, etc.
- Beneficiaries' anti-trafficking knowledge have increased through planned remedial education sessions as well as individual and group counselling. Also, communication and socialization between participants have increased.
- Anti-trafficking prevention services that are provided have had a positive impact on socialization of women and girls, especially from rural areas. Their life has changed because of their involvement in these activities. They are more aware about the risk of trafficking and their role to protect themselves and other from this phenomenon.
- Methods that are used to provide anti-trafficking knowledge for adolescent beneficiaries such as open discussions, analysis of real life cases, demonstration, plays, exhibitions, cultural and sportive activities have helped participants learn. They have also increased their willingness to share this knowledge with others.

- Though anti-trafficking prevention services that are provided by NPOs are evaluated positively by the beneficiaries, vocational training courses and employment placement are the most required services. One main reason is the low economic level of beneficiaries.
- Combination of vocational training courses with remedial education and counselling have proved to be effective. Though initially beneficiaries have been more interested to gain a profession, they were involved actively in education activities. Their participation in vocational training courses has resulted in decreased resistance from their families regarding their participation in prevention services.
- Based on the benefits from the anti-trafficking prevention services, all beneficiaries ask that these services continue and even expand in the future.

4.2. RECOMMENDATIONS

- A variety of anti-trafficking prevention services that are combined and reinforce each other is a condition for the success of AT prevention.
- NPOs should focus more on vocational training. These courses should be more diverse so their participants are more competitive in the labour market. NPOs should also mediate with local institutions and businesses about the employment of beneficiaries. Another way to materialize vocational courses is through supporting small business initiatives of beneficiaries. In this context, NPOs should strive for new funding opportunities for such initiatives.
- Remedial education courses and counselling should be combined with vocational training courses. Thus beneficiaries could not only gain a profession but also get AT education.
- Anti-trafficking prevention services should continue in the future. There are still many people, especially young girls and children that are not aware of this risk of trafficking. Prevention activities should target especially rural and remote areas with difficult economic and social situations, Roma communities, etc. In addition to people at risk of trafficking, AT education and awareness activities should also include young boys and men because joint efforts are needed to fight human trafficking.